What Missed in Metaphor Translation

สิ่งที่ขาดหายในงานแปลอุปลักษณ์

Jina Winitnaruemal (ชินา วินิจนฤมาลย์)* Dr. Sujaritlak Deepadung (ดร.สุจริตลักษณ์ ดีผดุง)**

Krittaya Akanisdha (กฤตยา อกนิษฐ์)***

ABSTRACT

This article is part of the study entitled "A Study of Figurative Language Translation in the S.E.A. Write Awarded Literature". The article will focus on metaphor translation. The sources for collecting figurative language were the three items of the S.E.A. Write Awarded literature namely, "Phiang Kwam Kluean Wai" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995), "We La" (Chart Kobchitti, 2010) and "Sing Mi Chivit Thi Riak Wa Khon" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.). Employing Abrams (1999)'s figurative language definition, the result revealed that the authors used metaphors mostly in these three literature. Further, the sources for studying metaphor translation were the three items of the S.E.A. Write Awarded literature: "Phiang Kwam Kluean Wai" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995), "We La" (Chart Kobchitti, 2010) and "Sing Mi Chivit Thi Riak Wa Khon" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.) and their English translation: "Mere Movement" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995), "Time" (Chart Kobchitti, 2010), "Man Alive" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.) and "Man Doomed" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.). Applying Newmark (1988)'s translation methods, the result demonstrated that the translators employed five translation methods: faithful translation, communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation.

บทคัดย่อ

บทความนี้เป็นส่วนหนึ่งของวิทยานิพนธ์เรื่อง "การศึกษาการแปลภาษาภาพพจน์ในวรรณกรรมรางวัลวรรณกรรมสร้างสรรค์ยอดเยี่ยมแห่งอาเซียน" เนื้อหาของบทความจะนำเสนอเฉพาะการศึกษาการแปลภาพพจน์อุปลักษณ์ในวรรณกรรมซีไรต์ แหล่งข้อมูลที่ใช้เพื่อรวบรวมภาษาภาพพจน์ คือวรรณกรรมซีไรต์จำนวน 3 เรื่อง ได้แก่ รวมกวีนิพนธ์ "เพียงความเคลื่อนไหว" ของเนาวรัตน์ พงษ์ไพบูลย์ (2535) นวนิยายเรื่อง "เวลา" ของชาติ กอบจิตติ (2553) และ รวมเรื่องสั้น "สิ่งมีชีวิตที่เรียกว่าคน" ของวินทร์ เลียววาริณ (ม.ป.ป.) ผลการศึกษาพบว่าผู้ประพันธ์ใช้ภาพพจน์อุปลักษณ์ในวรรณกรรมทั้งสามเรื่องนี้มากที่สุด ในการศึกษานี้ ผู้วิจัยใช้คำจำกัดความภาษาภาพพจน์ของ Abrams (1999) นอกจากนี้แหล่งข้อมูลที่ใช้ในการศึกษาการแปลอุปลักษณ์ในงานวิจัยนี้ ได้แก่ วรรณกรรมซีไรต์ต้นฉบับข้างต้นและคู่ฉบับแปลภาษาอังกฤษ ได้แก่ "Mere Movement" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995) "Time" (Chart Kobchitti, 2010) "Man Alive" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.) และ "Man Doomed" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.) จากการศึกษาการแปลอุปลักษณ์ตามวิธีการแปลของ Newmark (1988) ผู้วิจัยพบว่า ผู้แปลใช้วิธีแปลทั้งสิ้น 5 วิธี ได้แก่ การแปลแบบยึดต้นฉบับ การแปลเพื่อสื่อสาร การแปลโดยใช้สำนวนในภาษาฉบับแปล การแปลเอาความ และการดัดแปลงเนื้อหาต้นฉบับ

Key Words: metaphors, literature translation, metaphor translation, the S.E.A. Write Awarded literature

คำสำคัญ: อุปลักษณ์ การแปลวรรณกรรม การแปลอุปลักษณ์ วรรณกรรมซีไรต์

---

*Student, Master of Arts in Language and Culture for Communication and Development,   Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia, Mahidol University

**Associate Professor, Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia, Mahidol University

***Lecturer, Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia, Mahidol University

Introduction

This article is part of the study entitled "A Study of Figurative Language Translation in the S.E.A. Write Awarded Literature". The study's result showed that metaphors were mostly used in the three items of S.E.A. Write Awarded Literature: "Phiang Kwam Kluean Wai" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995), "We La" (Chart Kobchitti, 2010) and "Sing Mi Chivit Thi Riak Wa Khon" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.). Therefore this article will focus on metaphor translation. However, this study is still in progress.

Figurative language is the language used to convey idea or abstract in case there is no proper word to use or existing words are limited and not enough for using. Figurative language is not only found in imaginative text but also found in persuasive and informative text. However, it is mostly applied in imaginative text such as literature. It is quite difficult to get the meaning of figurative language since the reader or hearer need to understand its implicature which is the possibility to mean more than literal meaning. As the result, how to translate figurative language is much more difficult. If the translators cannot grasp the implicature of figurative language, they might not be able to translate correctly. This is the reason why the study of figurative language translation is needed.

Grice suggested the co-operative principle which is to "make your contribution such as is required, at the stage at which it occurs, by the accepted purpose or direction of the talk exchange in which you are engaged". The principle comprises of the four basic maxims of conversation namely, the maxim of quality, the maxim of quantity, the maxim of relevance and the maxim of manner. (Grice, 1978 cited in Levinson 1983, pp.101-102) According to Grice's theory of implicature, figure of speech occurs from the exploitation or flouting of the basic maxims of conversation. (Grice, 1978 cited in Levinson 1983, pp.147)

Abrams (1999) included metaphor into figurative language and also proposed its definition as "a word or expression that in literal usage denotes one kind of thing is applied to a distinctly different kind of thing, without asserting a comparison". (Abrams, 1999, pp.96-97) Applying Knowles and Moon's categorization of metaphors, the metaphors in this study were divided into creative and convention metaphors. "Creative metaphors are those which a writer/speaker constructs to express a particular idea or feeling in a particular context, and which a reader/hearer needs to deconstruct in order to understand what is meant. Conventional metaphors are found again and again to refer to a particular thing." (Knowles & Moon, 2006, pp.5-6)

Moreover, Lakoff and Johnson (1980)'s conceptual metaphors was also applied in this study since some metaphors were identified as conceptual metaphors. Conceptual metaphors consist of structural metaphors, orientational metaphors and ontological metaphors. Structural metaphors are defined as "one concept is metaphorically structured in terms of another". Orientational metaphors are spatial orientation such as up-down, in-out, front-

back, on-off, deep-shallow and central-peripheral, for example, 'happy is up; sad is down'. Lastly, ontological metaphors comprise of the two items of metaphors: entity and substance metaphors and container metaphors. Entity and substance metaphors are to view events, activities, emotions, ideas, etc., as entities and substances. Container metaphors are to project in-out orientation onto other physical objects bound by surfaces. (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980, pp.14-15, 25, 29)

In order to analyze metaphor translation, the researcher applied Newmark (1988)'s translation methods: faithful translation, communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation. (Newmark, 1988, pp.45-47) Further, denotation and connotation were also employed in this study. Denotation is the definition of word which is shown in dictionary and connotation is the implied meaning of word. (Yuwapa Chaisinwattana, 2009, pp.5-6)

Objectives of the study

The purposes were to study metaphors in the three items of S.E.A. Write Awarded literature and the translation of these metaphors from Thai into English.

Methodology

First, the researcher searched all genres of the S.E.A. Write Awarded literature, namely poetry, novel and short story, which were translated into English. The result showed that twelve books were translated from Thai into English namely, novel:

"Luk Isan" (Kampoon Boontawee, 1988), "Kam Pipaksa" (Chart Kobjitti, 1982), "Taling Sung Sung Nak" (Nikhom Raiyawa, 1984), "We La" (Chart Kobjitti, 2010), "Prachathippatai Bon Sen Khanan" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.). "Kwam Suk Khong Kati" (Ngampan Vejjajiva, 2006) and "Lab Lae Kaeng Khoi" (Uthis Haemamool, 2009), poetry: "Phaing Khwam Khluean Wai" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995), "Ma Kan Kluai" (Phaiwarin Khaongam, 2010) and "Mai Mi Ying Sao Nai Bot Kawi" (Sakariya Amataya, 2010), short story: "Khun Thong Chao Cha Klab Muea Fa Sang" (Aassiri Thammachot, 2007) and "Sing Mi Chiwit Thi Riak Wa Khon" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.) The selection process was based on the variety of content and the amounts of figurative language which are above 100 cases per a book. Finally, "Phiang Khwam Khluean Wai", "We La" and "Sing Mi Chiwit Thi Riak Wa Khon" were selected.

Second, all metaphors were collected and categorized by Abrams (1999)'s definition of metaphors. After that the researcher counted the amounts of metaphors.

Third, the researcher matched each metaphor with its English translation and analyzed the translation by applying Newmark (1988)'s translation methods. The analyzing of metaphor translation were based on these topics namely, the reasons why it is categorized as metaphor, the equivalence of meaning between the original metaphor and the English translation and lastly, the translation is still in the form of metaphor or not.

The Study of Metaphor Translation

Applying Newmark (1988)'s translation methods, the result revealed that the translators employed faithful translation, communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation to translate metaphors from Thai into English. To demonstrate the analysis of metaphor translation, the researcher will present the analysis of all translation methods applied in the English translation. In each example, source text, target text and the translation analysis were presented.

Example 1: Faithful translation

Faithful translation is the translation method which is an emphasis on the source language. Employing this method, the translators attempt to transfer the intention of the authors, the meaning of the source language and the grammatical correctness into the target language. (Newmark, 1988, p.46)

Source text: เตี่ยว่า "คนเราต้องมี<u>ราก</u> ไม่มีบรรพบุรุษก็ไม่มีตัวเรา" (สิ่งมีชีวิตที่เรียกว่าคน: 279)

Target text: Father said, "People must have <u>roots</u>. Without our ancestors, there would be no us." (Man Doomed: 143)

The author used the word "ราก" to refer to ancestor. Therefore the word "ราก" in the source text is metaphor. Further, this word is frequently used so it could be categorized as conventional metaphor. It is from the word 'รากเหง้า' which means 'the origin'. (Nawawan Panthumaetha, 2555, p.893) The translator rendered the word "roots" in the English translation. Moreover, the meaning of "root" was stated in

Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary as "the origin or basis of something". (2010, p.1331) As a result, the translated metaphor has the same meaning as the original metaphor and is also in the metaphor's form as the original one. In this case, the translator can transfer both meaning and form of the source text's metaphor into the English translation.

Example 2: Faithful translation

Source text: แมงดาว่า "พวกเรายัง<u>สอบไม่ผ่าน</u>หรอกเพราะไม่ว่าเราทั้งสามคนเป็นใคร รับบทอะไร สถานการณ์อะไร เราก็ยังเป็นคนเดียวกัน เป็นส่วนหนึ่งของกันและกัน" (สิ่งมีชีวิตที่เรียกว่าคน: 90)

Target text: The pimp says, "<u>None of us has passed the test</u>. The truth is, whoever the three of us are, whatever parts we are playing, in whatever situation, each of us is still part of a whole. We are each other." (Man Doomed: 191)

After analyzing the meaning of the phrase "สอบไม่ผ่าน" with its context, its meaning which the author intended to communicate to the readers should be 'not be able to overcome fear'. The author compared the obstacle in this context with the examination. Therefore the phrase "สอบไม่ผ่าน" was identified to be metaphor. It is also conventional metaphor because of frequent usage in both ordinary language usage and in literature. Then the researcher applied Lakoff and Johnson (1988)'s conceptual metaphor and found that this phrase was structural metaphor since the two different concept such as 'the obstacle' and 'the examination' were compared. After analyzing the meaning of metaphor "สอบไม่ผ่าน"

with its translation version of 'to pass the test', the researcher found that the translator applied faithful translation and adjusted the sentence to be grammatically correct by using positive sentence instead of the negative sentence. Finally, the meaning and the metaphor's form of the English translation are as equivalent as the source text.

Example 3: Communicative translation

Communicative translation is an attempt to produce the most comprehensible translation to the reader. The translators are strict to the contextual meaning of the source text. (Newmark, 1988, p.47)

Source text: the poem entitled "ใบไม้ป่า"
(เพียงความเคลื่อนไหว: 50)

Target text: the poem entitled "A Leaf in the Forest"
(Mere Movement: 180)

The poem entitled "ใบไม้ป่า" was included in "Phiang Khwam Khluean Wai". (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995) The phrase "ใบไม้ป่า" was used to refer to the activist named Chit Phumisak. As a result, this phrase is metaphor. And it is creative metaphor since it is used to refer to the specific person such as Chit Phumisak. In the English translation, the translator replaced the metaphor "ใบไม้ป่า" with "A Leaf in the Forest". After analyzing the meaning of the phrase "A Leaf in the Forest", the researcher found that the translator tried to explain the metaphor "ใบไม้ป่า" clearly by rendering "A Leaf in the Forest" into the translation. However, the other choice of this translation can be 'a forest leaf'. When considering the form of the phrase

"A Leaf in the Forest", it is still metaphor as the source text. In summary, the communicative translation applied in this case is able to contain both the meaning and metaphor's form of the original text.

Example 4: Idiomatic translation

Using idiomatic translation, the translators replace the source text with the idiom which is not found in the source language. (Newmark, 1988, p.47)

Source text: "อื๋อ! ดูรูปกับอ่านมันไปยังงั้นแหละ ฆ่าเวลาเล่น" กลิ่นน้ำเทาลอยฟุ้งมาเต็มจมูก
(สิ่งมีชีวิตที่เรียกว่าคน: 102)

Target text: "Oh those. I just left through them for the pictures and some stories, you know, to while away the times." (Man Doomed: 21)

The phrase "ฆ่าเวลา" is metaphor and can be identified as conventional metaphor since it is always used in common conversation. This phrase means 'to use up time'. (Nawawan Punthumetha, 2012, p.873) In this situation, the householder spent his spare time reading the erotic books. The translator used the idiom 'to while away the time', which means "to spend time in a pleasant lazy way" (Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary, 2010, p.1756), in the translation. In this case, the original metaphor's meaning is equivalent to the translation's meaning. However, the translator was able to keep only the source text's meaning while the metaphor's form was changed to be an idiom. Further, the idiom 'to kill time', which means "to spend time doing something that is not important while you are waiting for something else to happen" (Oxford Advanced

Learner's Dictionary, 2010, p.820), should be used in the translation since it is the most equivalent meaning with "ฆ่าเวลา".

Example 5: Free translation

Free translation is an attempt to render the meaning of content but the translators do not need to keep the form of the source text. (Newmark, 1988, p.46)

Source text: ทุกสิ่งทุกอย่างขึ้นกับเบื้องบนและเปลี่ยนแปลงได้เสมอ (สิ่งมีชีวิตที่เรียกว่าคน: 329)

Target text: Everything depends on what is decided up there and everything can change at any time. (Man Doomed: 187)

The word "เบื้องบน" means 'the person who has authority over the others'. (The Royal Institute Dictionary B.E. 2554, 2013, p.686) Applying Lakoff and Johnson (1988)'s conceptual metaphors, the researcher found that the word "เบื้องบน" should be identified as orientational metaphor 'high-low'. In the organization chart or the hierarchy, the person who is in the higher position will be in the top of the chart. As well as this case, the word "เบื้องบน", therefore, refers to someone who has more authority. Moreover, this word is always found in both ordinary language and literature, as a result, it is also conventional metaphor. In target text, the word "เบื้องบน" was rendered as "what is decided up there". The translator applied free translation to translate the metaphor "เบื้องบน" by paraphrasing it to be "what is decided up there". In this case, applying free translation can keep only the meaning

of the original metaphor while metaphor's form is lost.

Example 6: Adaptation

Adaptation is an emphasis on the source language's readers. It is always used in poetry translation. The translator will convert the source language's culture into the target language's culture. Rewriting is also employed in adaptation. (Newmark, 1988, p.46)

Source text: "ขนมถั่วแปบหรือไง" (เธอเอามือเขี่ยเข้านมคู่นั้น ก่อนลงมือเช็ดตัว) (เวลา: 61)

Target text: "These crepes, right?" (She playfully pats the old woman's breasts before setting about wiping her body.) (Time: 54)

The writer compared the breasts of an old woman with Thai snack called "ขนมถั่วแปบ". Then "ขนมถั่วแปบ" are metaphor since they refer to the old woman's breasts. However, in the translation the metaphor "ขนมถั่วแปบ" were replaced by 'these crepes' which are thin pancakes. (Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary, 2010, p.359) The translation method applied in this context is adaptation. The translator will replace the cultural term of the source text with the cultural term in target language which he/she considered to be the most equivalent meaning to the original one. In this case, not only the shape of 'ขนมถั่วแปบ' is similar to the shape of 'crepe' but both of them also look like the shape of an old woman's breasts. Employing adaptation in this case, the translator is able to transfer the form of metaphor and its suitable meaning into target text.

Discussion and conclusions

First of all, when choosing the theories to be applied in the qualitative research, the researcher should consider the theories which are most appropriate to the research's data. In this study, the researcher applied Newmark's translation methods, which consist of eight methods namely, word-for-word translation, literal translation, faithful translation, semantic translation, communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation to analyze figurative language translation. (Newmark, 1988, p.45) However, not all the methods were matched properly with the research's data, the researcher then applied only faithful translation, communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation.

Second, mutual culture between source language and target language is the main factor which determines the translation method. In case the cultural term found in the source text is the mutual culture of the two languages, the translators can apply faithful translation. The study's result showed that faithful translation is able to transfer both meaning and figurative language's form into the translation. However, applying communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation cannot convey both meaning and figurative language's form in all cases.

Third, subjectivity and bias might occur during the identification of translation methods. To avoid subjectivity and bias, firstly, the researcher should understand the definition of each translation method clearly and then thoroughly analyze the context together with the meaning of source text. Further, the researcher should rely on reliable references, for example, dictionary, encyclopedia, book or official website. Lastly, the methodology of this research can be applied to the study of figurative language translation in other sort of text such as informative text or persuasive text. Moreover, semantic theories should be applied in further study that is relevant to figurative language translation to avoid subjectivity of researcher.

In summary, metaphors were mostly used among the three items of S.E.A. Write Awarded Literature namely, "Phiang Kwam Kluean Wai" (Naowarat Phongphaiboon, 1995), "We La" (Chart Kobchitti, 2010) and "Sing Mi Chivit Thi Riak Wa Khon" (Win Lyovarin, n.d.). The study also revealed that faithful translation, communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation were employed in metaphor translation. Finally, mutual culture between the source text and the target text determines the equivalence in metaphor translation. Applying faithful translation, nothing is missed in metaphor translation while applying communicative translation, idiomatic translation, free translation and adaptation might miss either meaning or form of metaphor or both of them.

Acknowledgement

References

Abrams, M.H. A glossary of literary terms. 5th ed.

      New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston; 1999.

Chart Korbjitti. Time. Translated by Marcel Barang.

      3rd ed. Bangkok: Howling Books; 2003.

Chart Kobjitti. We La. 20th ed. Bangkok: Horn Press;

      2010. [in Thai]

Knowles M., Moon R. Introducing Metaphor. New

      York: Routledge; 2006.

Lakoff G., Johnson M. Metaphors we live by.

      Chicago: University of Chicago Press;

      1980.

Levinson, Stephen C. Pragmatics. Cambridge:

      Cambridge University Press; 1983.

Naowarat Phongphaiboon. Phiang Khwam Khluean

      Wai. Bangkok: Kled Thai; 2535. [in Thai]

Nawawan Panthumetha. Klang Kam. 6th ed. Bangkok:

      Amarin Publishing; 2012. [in That]

Newmark, Peter. A Textbook of Translation. Hemel

      Hempstead: Prentice-Hall International; 1988.

Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary. 8th ed. New

      York: Oxford University Press; 2010.

The Royal Institute Dictionary B.E. 2554. Bangkok:

      Nanmeebooks Publishing; 2013 [in Thai]

Win Lyovarin. Man Doomed. Translated by Prissana

      Boonsinsuk. Bangkok: 113 Company

      Limited; 2012.

Win Lyovarin. Man Alived. Translated by Prissana

      Boonsinsuk.Bangkok: 113 Company

      Limited; 2012.

Win Lyovarin. Sing Mi Chi Wit Thi Riak Wa Khon.

      Bangkok: 113 Company Ltd.; n.d. [in Thai]

Yuwapa Chaisinwattana. Introduction to Literature.

      3th ed. Bangkok: Thammasat University

      Press; 2009 [in Thai]